



State Of Arizona
Naturopathic Physicians Board of Medical Examiners
"Protecting the Public's Health"

1400 West Washington • Suite 230 • Phoenix, AZ 85007 • Voice Telephone 602-542-8242 • FAX 602-542-3093
TTY for Americans with Disability 800-367-8939 • Disability Voice Relay 800-842-4681

Janet Napolitano – Governor

Renee Waldman, NMD – Chairman • Debora Chelson, NMD – Vice Chairman • Ms Linda Barron– Secretary/Treasurer
Mr. Kip Micuda JD - Public Member • Catherine Walker, NMD – Physician Member
Daniel Rubin, ND-Physician Member • Mr. Evan Zang - Public Member •
Craig Runbeck, NMD – Executive Director

MINUTES
BOARD MEETING

Thursday • January 10th, 2008 • 1:00 p.m. • Basement Conference Room B-1
1400 West Washington • Phoenix, AZ 85007

1. Call to Order by Presiding Officer

- A. Roll call of Board members and establishment of a quorum to conduct meeting.
The Board meeting was called to order at 1:05 P.M.
Present were: Renee Waldman, NMD Debora Chelson, NMD Ms. Linda Barron
Mr. Kip Micuda, Catherine Walker, NMD Daniel Rubin, ND Mr. Evan Zang
7 present.
- B. Acknowledgement of presence of Board staff and legal counsel.
Dr. Craig Runbeck, Executive Director, Ms. Michelle Wood, Assistant Attorney General, and
Ms. Gail Anthony, Investigations and Licensing

2. Call to the Public

No public wished to address the Board.

3. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Consent Agenda *(Any item under consent may be removed for independent discussion and action by a Board Member.)*

- A. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Minutes of December 13, 2007**

The Board approved the Minutes of the December 13, 2007 meeting.

- B. **ED Report**

The Board approved the Executive Director's Report

- C. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Medical License(s) / Examination Application**

Randy Spicer	
--------------	--

The Board approved the issuance of the Medical License(s) by Examination.

- D. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Medical License(s) / Endorsement**

Robin Terrenaella	
-------------------	--

The Board approved the issuance of the Medical License(s) by Endorsement.

E. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Medical License

Jennifer Nevels	Beth Poindexter
Tracy Wooten	Yuka Tsukioka
Meghana Thanki	David Craig
Mary Ellen O'Brien	Anne Marie Fine
Oddveig Myhure	Michael Smith
Carrie Rittling	Lance Morris
Shelly S. Weisman	Leslie Marcum
Anesia Groves	Robert Ruiz
Laura Boe	David Thompson
Chad Schroer	George Miles
Kirk Slagel	Judy Hiell
David Cramer	Joel Morgan
William Troutt	Kannamma Kannan
David Craig	Robert Gear
Robert Upchurch	Benjamin Zorensky
Betty Yurgel	Adrienne Borg
Miriam Gilbert	Thomas Lee
David Hagen	Tara Peyman
John Imundo	Natalie Ham
Jessica Bramstedt	Mia Darling
Leslie Axelrod	F. Debbie Jacques
Autumn Holder	Konrad Kail
Sima Aidun	Mark Dietzgen
Karsten Alexandria	Jill Hoffman
Wayne Black	Kristy Anderson
Jeffrey Lee	Nancy Mullis
Carol Revak	Carlos Santo
M. Marlene Briggs	Jason Jensen
Camille Teale	Yesid Callejas
JoAnn Yanez	Robert Streisfeld
Joanne Feaster	Allison McDaniel
Jody Krukowski	Jaime Ewald
Carolyn Groves	S. Ross Dunbar
Barbara Dapcic	Laura Sickels
Sam Walters	Paul Mittman
Margie Simmon-Stubber	Valeria Birch
Garrett Smith	Shannon York
Timothy Visser	Teresa McBride
John Hartman	Brandie Gowey
Stephanie Pina	Nael Dagstani
Dawn Bantel	David Daily
Alzoria Evans	Alexis Brereton
Ralph Potter	Cheryl Johnson
Jessica Curcio	Michael Cronin
Gilbert Alvarado	Albert Chavez
Kyle Cronin	Orville Weyrich, Jr.
Julie Stears	Shahrazad Orona
Jeni Keilty	Michale Uzick
Mary Marcantel	Ann Watwood
Michele Wilkerson	Roxie Strand

Tara Swartz	Mark Tenborg
Leila Fosdick Turner	Shana Spector Deneen
Ramon Esquerdo	Jennifer Burns
Charles Wilkinson	Ann Seipt
Linda Kim	Sherdeen Graham
Karen D'Huyvetter	Kimberly Engard
Jennifer Trask	Veronica Pangia Kerr
M. Ann Murray	Jeanette M. Gallagher
Julie Keiffer	Jeffery Knytych
J.D. McCoy	Amy-Jane Lillie
Alzoria Evans	Richard Hodge
Suneil Jain	Paul Conyette
Hope Farner	Alice Alibrio
Marie Santora	Mark Corbin
Patricia Gaines	Kevon Arthurs
Nicole Taylor	Ardeshir Mehrabani
Stephanie Stark	Patricia Herman
Christina Kovalik	Katherine Raymer
Rebecca Carpenter	Dino V. Sainati
Fred Arnold	Paul Anderson
Bruce Scher	Denise Quance
Stephanie Eastman	Christine Sorensen
Cheryl Granger	Marcos de Escobar
Kenneth Proefrock	Nathan Champion
Nita Keskitalo	Maria Bell
Barbara Koudelka	Christine Madsen
O'Rourke, Kristen	Tue Truong
Jillian Finker	Jason Porter
Barbara Brooks	Sabine Garrett
Edward Geller	Susan Whiting
Lucinda Messer	Nancy Horner
Miriam Weber	Kerri Clark
Matthew Mitchell	Mercedes Williams
James Reagan	Agostino De Roma
Robert Morrissey	Quintanar, Noemi
Frank Tamburri	Sarv Varta Khalsa
Diaa Osman	Inge Barth
Kimberly Wilson	Michael Berke
Christina Compton	Kenneth McWilliams
Mary Laney	Susan Williams
Stacie Kelley	Diana Buehler
Filiberto Flores	Will Polec
Deborah Vacik	Natasha Ryan
Jennifer Ball	James Sheehan
Marianna Fisher	Kelly Hannigan
Allison Pritchard	Lisa Hilli
Michelle Mossell	Barbara Oxley
John Oxley	Janice Highfield
Gladys Ceballos-Logan	Susan Rudderham
Mark Rudderham	Susan Hawkins
Emmanouil Karampahtsis	Linda Ferguson
Alana Van Putten	Kimberly Volk
Schuyler McHenry	Andrea Lee

Michael DiPalma	Theresa Ramsey
Chriselda Beltran	Mario Galaburri
Christina Tondora	Dorothy Karcheski
Tilli Williams	Sara LaRoche
Cristina Romero-Bosch	Summer McAllister
Steven Ehrlich	Heather Paulson
Karen Van Der Veer	Ryan Krch
Rhonda Steinke	Jeffrey Potts
Rebekkah Sax	Erika McKeen
Jacqueline Carboni	Allen Anderson
Murray Dowell	Randall Robinson
Katherine Kamin	Valerie Olmstedt
Karen Sigurdson	Frances March
Cheryl Larson	Jeannine Maschak
Michelle Tucker	Apryl Krause
Jamie Kupperman	Heather Waldor
Ty Tallman	June Stevens
Erica Middlemiss	Nicole King
Melissa Dengler	Sara Hazel
Lisa Richardson	Firlande Volcy
Yvonne Skinner	William Nelson
Jesse Haggard	Emily Doak
Christie Yerby	Katrina Steinberger
Lewis Underwood	S.A. Weiss

The Board approved the Renewals of the Medical Licenses(s).

F. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) / Request(s) to Retire Medical License

Harold Ofgang	
---------------	--

The Board approved the request(s) to Retire the Medical License(s).

G. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Dispense (initial)

David Hagen	Tara Peyman
Ann Watwood	Alice Alibrio

The Board approved the issuance of the Initial Certificate(s) to Dispense.

H. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Rachel Woo	Alexander Schuster
Chere Edgar	Deborah Ardolf

The Board approved the issuance of the Clinical Training Certificate(s).

I. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Application(s) for Renewal of Certificate to Engage in a Clinical Training Program

Tonya McCoy	
-------------	--

The Board approved the Renewal of the Clinical Training Certificate(s).

Ms. Barron moved to accept the consent agenda. Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 7 ayes

4. Regulatory Matters

- A. **Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Investigations and Complaints. The Board may go into executive session to discuss records exempt by law from public inspection. The Board may also go into executive session to request legal advice from assistant attorney general.**

(1) Dr. Eli Ber, Case No. 06-029: Investigative Interview.

Dr. Ber was not present. After discussion and consideration by the Board. Dr. Rubin moved to accept the consent agreement with discussed change to paragraph 11 under Terms of Probation. Second by Dr. Chelson. Roll Call: Ms. Barron, aye; Dr. Walker, aye; Mr. Zang, aye; Dr. Rubin, aye; Mr. Micuda, aye; Dr. Waldman, aye; Dr. Chelson, aye. Motion carried 7 ayes.

(2) Dr. Yvonne Skinner, Case No. 08-005, Investigative Interview.

Dr. Skinner was present with Counsel, Mr. Robert Wurkin. Both made statements and answered questions by the Board. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms Barron moved to move the case to Formal Interview, and instructed staff to draft a consent agreement and order adopting the specifics as outlined in the Staff Summary. Second by Dr. Walker. Roll Call: Ms. Barron, aye; Dr. Walker, aye; Mr. Zang, aye; Dr. Rubin, aye; Mr. Micuda, aye; Dr. Waldman, aye; Dr. Chelson, aye. Motion carried 7 ayes.

(3) Brendan McCarthy, Application for Licensure, Case No. 08-009

Brendan McCarthy was present, made statements to the Board and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Rubin moved to issue the license with the Terms, as outlined in the Staff Recommendation, with the addition that staff monitor Dr. McCarthy's website on a monthly basis, and Dr. McCarthy submit to the Board staff for review, any printed marketing material. These terms are to be drafted in the form of a consent agreement and order. Second by Dr. Chelson. Roll Call: Dr. Chelson, aye; Dr. Waldman, aye; Mr. Micuda, aye; Dr. Rubin, aye; Mr. Zang, aye; Dr. Walker, aye; Ms. Barron, aye. Motion carried 7 ayes.

(4) Dr. Kirk Slagel, Case No. 06-045, Review an possible acceptance of Consent Agreement and Order.

Dr. Slagel was present, made statements to the Board and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Dr. Walker moved to accept the consent agreement and order as written and signed by Dr. Slagel. Second by Mr. Zang. Roll Call: Dr. Chelson, aye; Dr. Waldman, aye; Mr. Micuda, aye; Dr. Rubin, aye; Mr. Zang, aye; Dr. Walker, aye; Ms. Barron, aye. Motion carried 7 ayes.

(5) Melenie Dunn, Case No. 06-013, Formal Interview.

Dr. Dunn was present with Counsel Mr. Steve deBur. Both made statements to the Board and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Mr. Micuda moved to dismiss the case. Second by Dr. Chelson. Roll Call: Dr. Chelson, aye; Dr. Waldman, aye; Mr. Micuda, aye; Dr. Rubin, aye; Mr. Zang, aye; Dr. Walker, aye; Ms. Barron, aye. Motion carried 7 ayes.

(6) Dana Michaels, Case No. 07-008- Review and possible approval by the Board of Consent Agreement and Order.

Dana Michaels was present with Counsel, Mr. Fred Cummings. Both made statements to the Board and answered questions. After discussion and consideration by the Board, Ms. Barron moved to accept the Consent Agreement and Order as written. Second by Mr. Zang. Roll Call: Dr. Chelson, aye; Dr. Waldman, aye; Mr. Micuda, aye; Dr. Rubin, aye; Mr. Zang, aye; Dr. Walker, aye; Ms. Barron, aye. Motion carried 7 ayes.

Ms. Michelle Wood left the meeting at 3:15 PM.

B. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Persons Licensed by this Board. The Board may go into executive session to discuss records exempt by law from public inspection. The Board may also go into executive session to request legal advice from assistant attorney general.

(1) Dr. Ann Lovick, License Renewal. Works in the office of Dr. Catherine Walker.

Dr. Walker recused herself. Dr. Waldman moved to approve renewal of the Medical License, Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 6 ayes. 1 recused.

(2) Dr. Debora Smolinski, License Renewal, Wife of Dr. Daniel Ruben.

(3) Dr. Daniel Rubin, License Renewal.

Items 2 and 3 were considered at the same time. Dr. Rubin recused himself. Dr. Waldman moved to approved renewal of the Medical License(s). Second by Mr. Zang. Motion carried 6 ayes, 1 recused.

(4) Dr. Debora Chelson, License Renewal.

Dr. Chelson recused herself. Ms. Barron moved to renewal of the Medical License. Second by Mr. Micuda. Motion carried 6 ayes, 1 recused.

(5) Dr. Craig Runbeck, License Renewal.

Mr. Micuda moved to renew the Medical License. Second by Dr. Waldman. Motion carried 7 ayes.

Ms. Linda Barron left the meeting at 3:20 PM

5. Discussion, Consideration, Possible Decision and Vote by Board of Administrative and Procedural Matters. The Board may go into executive session to discuss records exempt by law from public inspection. The Board may also go into executive session to request legal advice from assistant attorney general.

(1) Election of Board Officers.

Mr. Micuda made a motion to move Dr. Chelson into the Chairman position, Ms. Barron into the Vice Chair position, and Dr. Rubin into the Secretary/Treasurer position. Motion carried 6 ayes 1 absent.

6. Information on potential consolidation legislation.

Dr. Runbeck gave a brief summary regarding the purposed Board consolidation legislation. No action required.

ADJOURNMENT

THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT 3:50 PM

Arizona Naturopathic Physicians Board of Medical Examiners

Date

